Welcome

Ted Cieslak, MD, MPH
Welcome: Ted Cieslak, MD, MPH

COVID-19 Ethics Advisory Committee: Abbey Lowe, MA
Matthew Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP

Crisis Standard of Care: Matthew Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP
Kathy Kinlaw, MDiv, HEC-C

Emerging Issues: Abbey Lowe, MA
Kathy Kinlaw, MDiv, HEC-C
Matthew Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP

NETEC Resources: Ted Cieslak, MD, MPH

Questions and Answers with NETEC
Welcome

National Emerging Special Pathogens Training and Education Center

Mission statement

To increase the capability of the United States public health and health care systems to safely and effectively manage individuals with suspected and confirmed special pathogens

For more information

Please visit us at www.netec.org or email us at info@netec.org
NETEC Overview

**Assessment**
- Empower hospitals to gauge their readiness using **Self-Assessment**
- Measure facility and healthcare worker readiness using **Metrics**
- Provide direct feedback to hospitals via **On-Site Assessment**

**Education**
- Provide self-paced education through **Online Trainings**
- Deliver didactic and hands-on simulation training via **In-Person Courses**
- COVID-19 focused **Webinars**

**Technical Assistance**
- **Onsite & Remote Guidance**
- Compile **Online Repository** of tools and resources
- Develop customizable **Exercise Templates** based on the HSEEP model
- Provide **Emergency On-Call Mobilization**

**Research Network**
- **Online Repository** Built for rapid implementation of clinical research protocols
- Develop Policies, Procedures and Data Capture Tools to facilitate research
- Create infrastructure for a **Specimen Biorepository**

Cross-Cutting, Supportive Activities
COVID-19 Ethics Advisory Committee

Abbey Lowe, MA
Matt Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP
Ethical Issues in Pandemic Response

National COVID-19 Ethics Advisory Committee

Convened by the Global Center for Health Security at the University of Nebraska Medical Center

Standing at the ready to provide guidance to ethical issues inherent to pandemic planning and response

Around the country, hospitals are either feeling the opening barrage of a horrifying pandemic or rapidly scrambling to prepare for an onslaught in their own backyard. Every possible niche of healthcare is bracing for the likelihood of a deluge to come.

The Global Center for Health Security Ethics Advisory Committee was established in the early stages of the COVID-19 outbreak to serve as a resource to those facing unprecedented ethical issues. Its membership represents a breadth of expertise in disaster and public health emergency ethics, both nationally and internationally.

Initially, much of the Committee’s work focused on supporting ethics requests regarding Crisis Standards of Care—helping health care institutions analyze and resolve difficult ethical issues occurring in the planning phase prior to moving into Crisis Standards of Care. While a significant portion of our efforts continue to address this need, the Committee's work has extended to include key bioethics issues within research, clinical, and public health ethics. The Committee is able to accept requests from civic, health care, and professional organizations related to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic.

Request an Ethics Consultation from the Ethics Advisory Committee

The Ethics Consultation service is intended to act as a resource to anyone who may be in need of guidance on COVID-19 specific ethical issues. This advisory service is free, and the Committee is able to accept requests from any public health, civic, health care, or professional organization.
### Ethical Issues in Pandemic Response

#### Committee Composition and Committee Action

- Clinical
- Regulatory
- Law
- Pediatric
- Palliative
- Pandemic
- Policy
- Academic Leadership
- Public Health
- International Representations
- Critical Care/Intensivist
- Disparities or Access Ethics
- Immunocompromised Populations

For us, this pandemic means being ready to support our hard-working colleagues as they face risks to their own health on top of the emotional toll that overstrained resources, death, and tough conversations can bring to us all.

Copyright, Nathan Gray, MD, 2020. Used with permission. 
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethics Requests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Triage Decision-Making</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>End of Life and Palliative Care in the Pandemic</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health Disparity and Fairness in Public Health Response</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PPE Allocation Strategies for Training Programs for Frontline Workers</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Crisis Standards of Care

Matt Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP
Kathy Kinlaw, MDiv, HEC-C
### Crisis standards of care

Crisis standards of care are applied when a pervasive or catastrophic disaster make it impossible to meet usual healthcare standards.

- **Conventional care** is everyday healthcare services.
- **Contingency care** arises when demand for medical staff, equipment, or pharmaceuticals begins to exceed supply. Contingency care seeks functionally equivalent care, recognizing that some adjustments to usual care are necessary.
- **Crisis care** occurs when resources are so depleted that functionally equivalent care is no longer possible.

---

Rapid Expert Consultation on Guiding Principles, Key Elements, and Core Messages for Crisis Standards of Care, March 28[1]
During a crisis, it is vitally important to adhere to core ethical principles:

- **Fairness**
- **The Duty of Care**
- **The Duty of Steward Resources**
- **Consistency**
- **Proportionality**
- **Accountability**
- **Transparency in Decision-Making**
Figure 1: Demand for healthcare services and supply of resources as a function of time after disaster onset, taking into account care capacity as a function of time (Hanfling, Alet E Vogt, Viswanathan, & Gostin, 2012, pp. 42)
Guiding Principles: Crisis Standard of Care (CSC)

- Planners must do everything possible never to enter CSC, and to spend as little time in CSC as possible (proportionality principle).
- CSC have the joint goals of extending the availability of key resources and minimizing the impact of shortages.
- CSC strive to save the most lives possible, recognizing that some individual patients will die, who might survive under usual care.
- Implementation of CSC will require facility-specific decisions regarding allocation of limited resources, but should be coordinated across facilities to ensure equity.

Adapted from: Rapid Expert Consultation on Guiding Principles, Key Elements, and Core Messages for Crisis Standards of Care, March 28[1]
Ethical Issues in Pandemic Response

Ethics in Critical Care Resource Allocation

Setting of Extreme Scarcity

• “Save the most lives” or “maximize benefits”
  • But how are these defined?
  • Survival to discharge? Life-years saved?

Any additional priorities/ethical approaches beyond lives saved?

• Life Cycle Approach
• Healthcare Workers, Essential Workers
  • “Instrumental Value”; Multiplier Effect
• Random allocation/lottery
• Children, pregnant women...
Emerging Issues

Kathy Kinlaw, MDiv, HEC-C
Matt Wynia, MD, MPH, FACP
Abbey Lowe, MA
### Disparities, Justice and COVID-19

- Why certain groups of people have been disproportionately affected by the virus will take extensive study
  - Higher rates of exposure, more comorbidities, differential care
  - Other social determinants of health, “structural” racism
- Concerns of those living with disabilities
- How to mitigate the disease in populations impacted?
- How does Crisis Standard of Care planning account for those being disproportionately affected by COVID-19?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Issues in Pandemic Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Personal Protective Equipment (PPE)**

- Ethical process for allocating PPE?
- Ethical criteria for allocating PPE?
- Communication challenges
- What counts as “safe enough” use of PPE?
Other Clinical Issues in a Time of Scarcity

- CPR decisions
  - CPR and use of PPE

- Implications for advance care planning
  - Early discussions
  - Altered pathways to securing patient information
  - Support for altruism versus risk of coercion

- Communicating effectively and compassionately

- Surgical scheduling
NETEC Resources

Ted Cieslak, MD, MPH
NETEC will continue to build resources, develop online education, and deliver technical training to meet the needs of our partners.

Ask for help!

Send questions to info@netec.org - they will be answered by NETEC SMEs.

Submit a Technical Assistance request at NETEC.org.
Slide 13: Palliative Care in the Time of COVID


Slide 14: Ethics Advisory Committee

https://www.unmc.edu/healthsecurity/ethics/index.html

Hastings Center: Ethics Resources on Coronavirus (COVID-19)

https://www.thehastingscenter.org/ethics-resources-on-the-coronavirus/
Questions and Answers